

Discussion on: “The pro-competitive effects of imports from China: An analysis of firm-level price data” by M. Bugamelli, S. Fabiani and E. Sette

Marianna Belloc

Sapienza University of Rome

November 24, 2009

Italy's external competitiveness conference

Ministero dell'Economia e delle Finanze

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms
- Detailed dataset: information at the firm-level

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms
- Detailed dataset: information at the firm-level
 - ▶ Data on prices → Avoid measurement error which may incur if unit values are used as proxy

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms
- Detailed dataset: information at the firm-level
 - ▶ Data on prices → Avoid measurement error which may incur if unit values are used as proxy
 - ▶ Intensity of import competition → Rather than using a natural experiment (such as entrance of China in the WTO) or tariff changes

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms
- Detailed dataset: information at the firm-level
 - ▶ Data on prices → Avoid measurement error which may incur if unit values are used as proxy
 - ▶ Intensity of import competition → Rather than using a natural experiment (such as entrance of China in the WTO) or tariff changes
- Good identification strategy: The authors are dealing with causality

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms
- Detailed dataset: information at the firm-level
 - ▶ Data on prices → Avoid measurement error which may incur if unit values are used as proxy
 - ▶ Intensity of import competition → Rather than using a natural experiment (such as entrance of China in the WTO) or tariff changes
- Good identification strategy: The authors are dealing with causality
- Results consistent with theory: Increasing Chinese import competition exerts a downward pressure on Italian firms' pricing strategies

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms
- Detailed dataset: information at the firm-level
 - ▶ Data on prices → Avoid measurement error which may incur if unit values are used as proxy
 - ▶ Intensity of import competition → Rather than using a natural experiment (such as entrance of China in the WTO) or tariff changes
- Good identification strategy: The authors are dealing with causality
- Results consistent with theory: Increasing Chinese import competition exerts a downward pressure on Italian firms' pricing strategies
- Robustness and extensions

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms
- Detailed dataset: information at the firm-level
 - ▶ Data on prices → Avoid measurement error which may incur if unit values are used as proxy
 - ▶ Intensity of import competition → Rather than using a natural experiment (such as entrance of China in the WTO) or tariff changes
- Good identification strategy: The authors are dealing with causality
- Results consistent with theory: Increasing Chinese import competition exerts a downward pressure on Italian firms' pricing strategies
- Robustness and extensions
 - ▶ Role of sector heterogeneity

This paper

- Clear research question: Testing the discipline effect of increasing import competition of Chinese products on Italian firms
- Detailed dataset: information at the firm-level
 - ▶ Data on prices → Avoid measurement error which may incur if unit values are used as proxy
 - ▶ Intensity of import competition → Rather than using a natural experiment (such as entrance of China in the WTO) or tariff changes
- Good identification strategy: The authors are dealing with causality
- Results consistent with theory: Increasing Chinese import competition exerts a downward pressure on Italian firms' pricing strategies
- Robustness and extensions
 - ▶ Role of sector heterogeneity
 - ▶ Role of firm heterogeneity

Heterogeneity across sectors

- Sector heterogeneity as measured by differences in R&D outlays and skill intensity

Heterogeneity across sectors

- Sector heterogeneity as measured by differences in R&D outlays and skill intensity
 - ▶ R&D outlays: firms in sectors with higher R&D expenditures are less exposed to price competition

Heterogeneity across sectors

- Sector heterogeneity as measured by differences in R&D outlays and skill intensity
 - ▶ R&D outlays: firms in sectors with higher R&D expenditures are less exposed to price competition
 - ▶ No statistically significant effects of skill intensity

Heterogeneity across sectors

- Sector heterogeneity as measured by differences in R&D outlays and skill intensity
 - ▶ R&D outlays: firms in sectors with higher R&D expenditures are less exposed to price competition
 - ▶ No statistically significant effects of skill intensity
- Other variables to rank sectors (US):

Heterogeneity across sectors

- Sector heterogeneity as measured by differences in R&D outlays and skill intensity
 - ▶ R&D outlays: firms in sectors with higher R&D expenditures are less exposed to price competition
 - ▶ No statistically significant effects of skill intensity
- Other variables to rank sectors (US):
 - ▶ Scope for horizontal differentiation (Rauch 99): whether or not the good is sold on an organized exchange and whether or not it is reference priced in a trade publication

Heterogeneity across sectors

- Sector heterogeneity as measured by differences in R&D outlays and skill intensity
 - ▶ R&D outlays: firms in sectors with higher R&D expenditures are less exposed to price competition
 - ▶ No statistically significant effects of skill intensity
- Other variables to rank sectors (US):
 - ▶ Scope for horizontal differentiation (Rauch 99): whether or not the good is sold on an organized exchange and whether or not it is reference priced in a trade publication
 - ▶ Importance of relationship-specific investments across industries (Nunn 07): proportion of inputs in each sector that are bought and sold on an exchange, reference priced, or neither

Heterogeneity across sectors

- Sector heterogeneity as measured by differences in R&D outlays and skill intensity
 - ▶ R&D outlays: firms in sectors with higher R&D expenditures are less exposed to price competition
 - ▶ No statistically significant effects of skill intensity
- Other variables to rank sectors (US):
 - ▶ Scope for horizontal differentiation (Rauch 99): whether or not the good is sold on an organized exchange and whether or not it is reference priced in a trade publication
 - ▶ Importance of relationship-specific investments across industries (Nunn 07): proportion of inputs in each sector that are bought and sold on an exchange, reference priced, or neither
 - ▶ Complexity (Levchenko 07): measured as the number of intermediates required for production in each sector

Heterogeneity across sectors

- Sector heterogeneity as measured by differences in R&D outlays and skill intensity
 - ▶ R&D outlays: firms in sectors with higher R&D expenditures are less exposed to price competition
 - ▶ No statistically significant effects of skill intensity
- Other variables to rank sectors (US):
 - ▶ Scope for horizontal differentiation (Rauch 99): whether or not the good is sold on an organized exchange and whether or not it is reference priced in a trade publication
 - ▶ Importance of relationship-specific investments across industries (Nunn 07): proportion of inputs in each sector that are bought and sold on an exchange, reference priced, or neither
 - ▶ Complexity (Levchenko 07): measured as the number of intermediates required for production in each sector
 - ▶ Routineness (Costinot, Oldenski & Rauch 09): intensity in “problem solving” (need for ex post adaptation by a headquarters and a supplier)

Heterogeneity across firms I

- Price or quality competition?

Heterogeneity across firms I

- Price or quality competition?
- Two mechanisms:

Heterogeneity across firms I

- Price or quality competition?
- Two mechanisms:
 - ▶ quality upgrading

Heterogeneity across firms I

- Price or quality competition?
- Two mechanisms:
 - ▶ quality upgrading
 - ▶ firm selection (firms that are not able to react in terms of either price or quality exit the market)

Heterogeneity across firms I

- Price or quality competition?
- Two mechanisms:
 - ▶ quality upgrading
 - ▶ firm selection (firms that are not able to react in terms of either price or quality exit the market)
- This paper focuses on the effects on pricing strategies, but dealing with firms heterogeneity also answers questions about responses of different firms (price and non-price strategies) to the same exogenous trade shock

Heterogeneity across firms I

- Price or quality competition?
- Two mechanisms:
 - ▶ quality upgrading
 - ▶ firm selection (firms that are not able to react in terms of either price or quality exit the market)
- This paper focuses on the effects on pricing strategies, but dealing with firms heterogeneity also answers questions about responses of different firms (price and non-price strategies) to the same exogenous trade shock
 - ▶ Prices as a proxy for quality (firms producing higher quality products tend to reduce prices the least)

Heterogeneity across firms I

- Price or quality competition?
- Two mechanisms:
 - ▶ quality upgrading
 - ▶ firm selection (firms that are not able to react in terms of either price or quality exit the market)
- This paper focuses on the effects on pricing strategies, but dealing with firms heterogeneity also answers questions about responses of different firms (price and non-price strategies) to the same exogenous trade shock
 - ▶ Prices as a proxy for quality (firms producing higher quality products tend to reduce prices the least)
- How can we better investigate these mechanisms?

Heterogeneity across firms II

- Schott (2004, 2008) documents

Heterogeneity across firms II

- Schott (2004, 2008) documents
 - ▶ an increasing China-OECD product similarity (far more than other trade partners) over the 1980-2005 period

Heterogeneity across firms II

- Schott (2004, 2008) documents
 - ▶ an increasing China-OECD product similarity (far more than other trade partners) over the 1980-2005 period
 - ▶ a widening China-OECD price gap between 1980 and 2005. This hints that the price competition between China and more developed countries may be less direct than the overlap in product markets suggests (similar results for Belgium by Monfort et al. 08)

Heterogeneity across firms II

- Schott (2004, 2008) documents
 - ▶ an increasing China-OECD product similarity (far more than other trade partners) over the 1980-2005 period
 - ▶ a widening China-OECD price gap between 1980 and 2005. This hints that the price competition between China and more developed countries may be less direct than the overlap in product markets suggests (similar results for Belgium by Monfort et al. 08)
- In particular we may expect the widening price gap to be the result of a tendency in increasing product sophistication (quality) or dropping the least sophisticated varieties from the market (firms tend to reinforce their positions on the upper segments of each sector)

Heterogeneity across firms II

- Schott (2004, 2008) documents
 - ▶ an increasing China-OECD product similarity (far more than other trade partners) over the 1980-2005 period
 - ▶ a widening China-OECD price gap between 1980 and 2005. This hints that the price competition between China and more developed countries may be less direct than the overlap in product markets suggests (similar results for Belgium by Monfort et al. 08)
- In particular we may expect the widening price gap to be the result of a tendency in increasing product sophistication (quality) or dropping the least sophisticated varieties from the market (firms tend to reinforce their positions on the upper segments of each sector)
- The authors test if the price competition is stronger or weaker depending on the firm size (quality complementarity hypothesis by Kugler & Verhoogen 08: positive correlation between firm size and product quality - increasing in the scope of quality differentiation)

Heterogeneity across firms II

- Schott (2004, 2008) documents
 - ▶ an increasing China-OECD product similarity (far more than other trade partners) over the 1980-2005 period
 - ▶ a widening China-OECD price gap between 1980 and 2005. This hints that the price competition between China and more developed countries may be less direct than the overlap in product markets suggests (similar results for Belgium by Monfort et al. 08)
- In particular we may expect the widening price gap to be the result of a tendency in increasing product sophistication (quality) or dropping the least sophisticated varieties from the market (firms tend to reinforce their positions on the upper segments of each sector)
- The authors test if the price competition is stronger or weaker depending on the firm size (quality complementarity hypothesis by Kugler & Verhoogen 08: positive correlation between firm size and product quality - increasing in the scope of quality differentiation)
- **Role of firm size: it captures most of the firm heterogeneity**

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments
- **Productivity**

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments
- Productivity
 - ▶ Low productivity firms exit the market

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments
- Productivity
 - ▶ Low productivity firms exit the market
 - ▶ High productivity firms expand

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments
- Productivity
 - ▶ Low productivity firms exit the market
 - ▶ High productivity firms expand
- Capital intensity

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments
- Productivity
 - ▶ Low productivity firms exit the market
 - ▶ High productivity firms expand
- Capital intensity
 - ▶ More capital intensive plants are more likely to survive

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments
- Productivity
 - ▶ Low productivity firms exit the market
 - ▶ High productivity firms expand
- Capital intensity
 - ▶ More capital intensive plants are more likely to survive
 - ▶ Firms switch into industries that are more capital intensive

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments
- Productivity
 - ▶ Low productivity firms exit the market
 - ▶ High productivity firms expand
- Capital intensity
 - ▶ More capital intensive plants are more likely to survive
 - ▶ Firms switch into industries that are more capital intensive
 - ▶ Capital intensity rises with product sophistication: firms product mix tends to adjust towards more sophistication (core competencies, Bernard et al. 06)

Heterogeneity across firms III

- Other dimensions of firm heterogeneity: productivity, product quality, R&D expenditure, capital intensity, labour mix, input quality
- Other questions to answer: whether firms exposed to price competition from low-wage countries tend to switch into industries that are more skill intensive and innovative, or to higher quality segments
- Productivity
 - ▶ Low productivity firms exit the market
 - ▶ High productivity firms expand
- Capital intensity
 - ▶ More capital intensive plants are more likely to survive
 - ▶ Firms switch into industries that are more capital intensive
 - ▶ Capital intensity rises with product sophistication: firms product mix tends to adjust towards more sophistication (core competencies, Bernard et al. 06)
 - ★ countries engage in a relative specialization towards the varieties that are more closely related to their relative factor endowments